

Report on the Tustin Estate Whittling Down Test of Opinion.

Open Communities was tasked to facilitate a process whereby the Tustin estate community could offer its opinion on a number of options for the future of the estate. In reaching a final option, the choices of residents were counted and determined using the Single Transferable Vote method. This method depends on an option securing a quota of 50% plus one of returned papers.

On the first count, no option achieved the quota. Option 4 was closest, achieving 49.4% across the estate. Under the STV method, we then looked at the least favoured option (2) and distributed the 2nd choice of the 22 residents across the remaining four options. None of the 22 respondents opted for option 4 as their 2nd choice so the figure remained at 49.4%.

We then looked at the next least favoured option (3) and distributed the 2nd choice of the 33 residents across the remaining three options, and redistributing the 3rd choice of the 6 residents who opted for option 3 as their second favourite option. Fourteen of these 39 respondents opted for option 4 as their 2nd choice. This pushed Option 4 over the line with 57% and so achieved the quota.

The options, as outlined in the test of opinion paper sent to residents, were as follows;

- **Option 1 MAINTAIN**

If you want things to stay as they are now, with no new homes, then you should choose this option. As part of the council's promise to maintain and provide a decent home we will include new kitchens and bathrooms for council tenants.

- **Option 2 REFURBISHMENT AND SOME NEW HOMES**

This option is like Option 1, but the council will raise some money from building between 50 and 100 new homes on existing empty space on the estate and selling some to pay for small block and estate improvements,. Half of the new homes will be council homes and will be for Tustin tenants who need to move for health reasons, or because they want a smaller home, or need a bigger home.

- **Option 3 PARTIAL REFURBISHMENT AND MANY NEW HOMES**

In this option, the council will keep the maisonettes in 21–98 Heversham House and Bowness, and the houses at Manor Grove and carry out works to maintain and provide a decent home. Tenants in these homes will have a new kitchen and new bathroom. There will also be some block and estate works and improvements. The council will demolish Kentmere House, Hillbeck Close, Ullswater House and the bedsit flats on the end of Heversham House in order to build replacement homes for the existing residents and between 320

and 370 additional new homes, half of which will be for council tenants. This option will include a newly built school and dedicated housing for the over 55s.

- **Option 4 DEMOLITION AND REBUILD OF THE LOW-RISE HOMES**

This option means all existing homes on the estate (but not the tower blocks) will be knocked down. The council will do this in a step by step way, building new homes after a block is demolished so that tenants have new homes to move to before the next block is demolished. Overall there will be between 800 and 850 new homes, which include replacement of the existing 298 homes. After replacing existing council homes, half of the additional new homes will be for council tenants. This option will include a newly built school, dedicated housing for the over 55s and a new park at the centre of the estate.

- **Option 5 DEMOLITION AND REBUILD OF THE LOW-RISE HOMES EXCEPT MANOR GROVE**

This option is like Option 4, but the council won't demolish any homes in Manor Grove. Overall there will be between 770 and 820 new homes built. As a result there will be fewer new council homes built, although the council will build some new homes on some of the space around Manor Grove. This option will include a newly built school, dedicated housing for the over 55s and a new park at the centre of the estate.

The Test of Opinion took place between Thursday 10th September and Thursday 1st October 2020. 276 papers were returned out of a possible 485 (57%) of which eleven were spoilt. There were 265 completed and counted papers (55%).

1) Method of return

Ballot box	107	40%
Post	90	34%
Door knocking	42	16%
Online	26	10%
Total	265	100%

2) Papers received by block

Block	Potential Returns	Returns	%
Bowness	34	24	71%
Heversham	103	65	63%
Hillbeck	29	20	69%
Kentmere	34	25	74%
Manor Grove	59	42	71%
Ambleside	83	40	48%
Grasmere	72	22	31%
Windermere	71	27	38%
Total	485	265	55%

Observations.

Only three blocks returned less than 50% of papers – Ambleside, Grasmere and Windermere. Kentmere has the highest return rate at 74%

3) Papers received by tenure

Tenure	Potential Returns	Returns	%
Freeholder	33	24	73%
Housing Applicant	16	10	63%
Leaseholder	41	23	56%
Tenant	395	208	53%
	485	265	55%

4) Total papers received by Option and ranked. Overall global figures

Total	Option 1	Option 1 (%)	Option 2	Option 2 (%)	Option 3	Option 3 (%)	Option 4	Option 4 (%)	Option 5	Option 5 (%)
Rank 1	40	15%	22	8%	33	12%	131	49%	39	15%
Rank 2	25	9%	47	18%	28	11%	34	13%	98	37%
Rank 3	23	9%	35	13%	128	48%	14	5%	24	9%
Rank 4	21	8%	111	42%	23	9%	19	7%	43	16%
Rank 5	124	47%	13	5%	11	4%	47	18%	24	9%

Observations

Option 4 ranked highest as the 1st option with a 49.4% return, falling just short of the 50% plus one mark.

5) Papers received by low/high rise blocks including options and ranks

Low rise blocks are Bowness House, Heversham House, Kentmere House, Manor Grove and Hillbeck House

LOW RISE	Option 1	Option 1 (%)	Option 2	Option 2 (%)	Option 3	Option 3 (%)	Option 4	Option 4 (%)	Option 5	Option 5 (%)
Rank 1	28	16%	13	7%	26	15%	77	44%	32	18%
Rank 2	20	11%	35	20%	20	11%	28	16%	63	36%
Rank 3	21	12%	30	17%	83	47%	8	5%	17	10%
Rank 4	21	12%	70	40%	19	11%	12	7%	33	19%
Rank 5	77	44%	12	7%	10	6%	41	23%	16	9%

Observations

Option 4 again ranked highest among all low rise residents as the 1st option with 44% return.

High Rise blocks are Ambleside Point, Grasmere Point and Windemere Point

HIGH RISE	Option 1	Option 1 (%)	Option 2	Option 2 (%)	Option 3	Option 3 (%)	Option 4	Option 4 (%)	Option 5	Option 5 (%)
Rank 1	12	13%	9	10%	7	8%	54	61%	7	8%
Rank 2	5	6%	12	13%	8	9%	6	7%	35	39%
Rank 3	2	2%	5	6%	45	51%	6	7%	7	8%
Rank 4	0	0%	41	46%	4	4%	7	8%	10	11%
Rank 5	47	53%	1	1%	1	1%	6	7%	8	9%

Observations

Option 4 again ranked highest among all high rise residents at 61% return.

6) Papers received by block by option and ranked

Ambleside Point	Option 1	Option 1 (%)	Option 2	Option 2 (%)	Option 3	Option 3 (%)	Option 4	Option 4 (%)	Option 5	Option 5 (%)
Rank 1	4	10%	6	15%	2	5%	25	63%	3	8%
Rank 2	1	3%	3	8%	5	13%	1	3%	15	38%
Rank 3	1	3%	3	8%	16	40%	2	5%	2	5%
Rank 4	0	0%	16	40%	1	3%	2	5%	3	8%
Rank 5	19	48%	0	0%	0	0%	1	3%	3	8%

Bowness House	Option 1	Option 1 (%)	Option 2	Option 2 (%)	Option 3	Option 3 (%)	Option 4	Option 4 (%)	Option 5	Option 5 (%)
Rank 1	0	0%	0	0%	4	17%	12	50%	8	33%
Rank 2	3	13%	3	13%	2	8%	7	29%	9	38%
Rank 3	8	33%	6	25%	7	29%	1	4%	1	4%
Rank 4	3	13%	6	25%	8	33%	1	4%	3	13%
Rank 5	9	38%	7	29%	1	4%	2	8%	2	8%

Grasmere Point	Option 1	Option 1 (%)	Option 2	Option 2 (%)	Option 3	Option 3 (%)	Option 4	Option 4 (%)	Option 5	Option 5 (%)
Rank 1	2	9%	0	0%	1	5%	18	82%	1	5%
Rank 2	1	5%	2	9%	1	5%	1	5%	11	50%
Rank 3	0	0%	0	0%	13	59%	2	9%	1	5%
Rank 4	0	0%	12	55%	1	5%	1	5%	1	5%
Rank 5	12	55%	1	5%	0	0%	0	0%	2	9%

Heversham House	Option 1	Option 1 (%)	Option 2	Option 2 (%)	Option 3	Option 3 (%)	Option 4	Option 4 (%)	Option 5	Option 5 (%)
Rank 1	8	12%	3	5%	10	15%	37	57%	7	11%
Rank 2	3	5%	11	17%	3	5%	11	17%	32	49%
Rank 3	10	15%	13	20%	30	46%	0	0%	5	8%
Rank 4	3	5%	30	46%	7	11%	7	11%	10	15%
Rank 5	37	57%	1	2%	8	12%	6	9%	5	8%

Hillbeck Close	Option 1	Option 1 (%)	Option 2	Option 2 (%)	Option 3	Option 3 (%)	Option 4	Option 4 (%)	Option 5	Option 5 (%)
Rank 1	1	5%	2	10%	4	20%	11	55%	2	10%
Rank 2	1	5%	1	5%	2	10%	5	25%	9	45%
Rank 3	0	0%	0	0%	10	50%	2	10%	5	25%
Rank 4	3	15%	13	65%	1	5%	0	0%	0	0%
Rank 5	13	65%	2	10%	0	0%	1	5%	1	5%

Kentmere House	Option 1	Option 1 (%)	Option 2	Option 2 (%)	Option 3	Option 3 (%)	Option 4	Option 4 (%)	Option 5	Option 5 (%)
Rank 1	5	20%	5	20%	4	16%	9	36%	2	8%
Rank 2	5	20%	7	28%	4	16%	3	12%	5	20%
Rank 3	0	0%	1	4%	12	48%	4	16%	4	16%
Rank 4	1	4%	9	36%	1	4%	4	16%	5	20%
Rank 5	12	48%	0	0%	0	0%	3	12%	6	24%

Manor Grove	Option 1	Option 1 (%)	Option 2	Option 2 (%)	Option 3	Option 3 (%)	Option 4	Option 4 (%)	Option 5	Option 5 (%)
Rank 1	14	33%	3	7%	4	10%	8	19%	13	31%
Rank 2	8	19%	13	31%	9	21%	2	5%	8	19%
Rank 3	3	7%	10	24%	24	57%	1	2%	2	5%
Rank 4	11	26%	12	29%	2	5%	0	0%	15	36%
Rank 5	6	14%	2	5%	1	2%	29	69%	2	5%

Windermere Point	Option 1	Option 1 (%)	Option 2	Option 2 (%)	Option 3	Option 3 (%)	Option 4	Option 4 (%)	Option 5	Option 5 (%)
Rank 1	6	22%	3	11%	4	15%	11	41%	3	11%
Rank 2	3	11%	7	26%	2	7%	4	15%	9	33%
Rank 3	1	4%	2	7%	16	59%	2	7%	4	15%
Rank 4	0	0%	13	48%	2	7%	4	15%	6	22%
Rank 5	16	59%	0	0%	1	4%	5	19%	3	11%

Observations

Option 4 is the 1st choice of more respondents in all blocks except Manor Grove, where it is third favourite behind option 1 (33%) and option 5 (31%)

7) Papers received by tenure by option and ranked

Tenant	Option 1	Option 1 (%)	Option 2	Option 2 (%)	Option 3	Option 3 (%)	Option 4	Option 4 (%)	Option 5	Option 5 (%)
Rank 1	26	13%	21	10%	27	13%	113	54%	21	10%
Rank 2	18	9%	36	17%	20	10%	25	12%	80	38%
Rank 3	15	7%	23	11%	100	48%	12	6%	20	10%
Rank 4	12	6%	86	41%	18	9%	18	9%	32	15%
Rank 5	105	50%	10	5%	6	3%	24	12%	22	11%

Housing Applicant	Option 1	Option 1 (%)	Option 2	Option 2 (%)	Option 3	Option 3 (%)	Option 4	Option 4 (%)	Option 5	Option 5 (%)
Rank 1	1	10%	0	0%	1	10%	7	70%	1	10%
Rank 2	0	0%	1	10%	2	20%	2	20%	5	50%
Rank 3	0	0%	3	30%	5	50%	1	10%	2	20%
Rank 4	0	0%	6	60%	1	10%	0	0%	2	20%
Rank 5	9	90%	0	0%	1	10%	0	0%	0	0%

Leaseholder	Option 1	Option 1 (%)	Option 2	Option 2 (%)	Option 3	Option 3 (%)	Option 4	Option 4 (%)	Option 5	Option 5 (%)
Rank 1	6	26%	1	4%	2	9%	8	35%	6	26%
Rank 2	1	4%	3	13%	2	9%	7	30%	7	30%
Rank 3	7	30%	2	9%	8	35%	1	4%	2	9%
Rank 4	1	4%	10	43%	3	13%	1	4%	4	17%
Rank 5	8	35%	3	13%	4	17%	3	13%	1	4%

Freeholder	Option 1	Option 1 (%)	Option 2	Option 2 (%)	Option 3	Option 3 (%)	Option 4	Option 4 (%)	Option 5	Option 5 (%)
Rank 1	7	29%	0	0%	3	13%	3	13%	11	46%
Rank 2	6	25%	7	29%	4	17%	0	0%	6	25%
Rank 3	1	4%	7	29%	15	63%	0	0%	0	0%
Rank 4	8	33%	9	38%	1	4%	0	0%	5	21%
Rank 5	2	8%	0	0%	0	0%	20	83%	1	4%

Observations

Option 4 is the 1st choice of more respondents in all tenures except freeholders, where it is joint third favourite behind option 5 (46%) and option 1 (29%)

8) Single Transferable Vote - Redistribution of papers

The favourite option (4) has 131 papers (49.4%). A total of 134 were required for any option to be the outright winner. After redistributing the 2nd choice of the 22 residents who opted for the least favourite option, Option 4 still has 131 papers. That is, none of the residents who opted for the least favourite option (2) put option 4 as their next choice.

The same process was used with the next least favourite option (3). After redistributing the 2nd choice of the 33 residents who opted for the 2nd least favourite option, and redistributing the 3rd choice of the 6 residents who opted for option 3 as their second favourite option, option 4 took fourteen of these next favourite choices and so achieved a total of 145 papers or 57% of the total and so achieved over the 50% + one quota.

	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3	Option 4	Option 5
Rank 1	40 - 15%	22 - 8%	33 - 12%	131 - 49%	39 - 15%
Redistribute Option 2	52 - 20%		39 - 15%	131 - 50%	39 - 15%
Redistribute Option 3	61 - 24%			145 - 57%	48 - 19%

Least favourite option is Option 2 with 22 papers.

Of the 22 papers:

- 12 ranked option 1 as their second favourite.
- 6 ranked option 3 as their second favourite.
- 4 only gave a favourite option.

Second least favourite option is Option 3 with 33 papers.

Of the 33 papers:

- 5 ranked option 1 as their second favourite
- 10 ranked option 2 as their second favourite
- 11 ranked option 4 as their second favourite
- 6 ranked option 5 as their second favourite